LABOUR MARKET TRENDS AND PROSPECTS FOR ECONOMIC COMPETITIVENESS OF LITHUANIA

Aušrytė Rastenienė and Neringa Ramanauskė
Vilnius University, Lithuania

Presentation prepared for the Conference:
Competitiveness Strategies for the EU Small States
Chambre de Commerce Luxembourg, Kirchberg
19-20 April 2018
Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Conference Competitiveness Strategies for the EU Small States

By Dr. Aušrytė Rastenienė & Neringa Ramanauskė
Plan of the presentation

1. Introduction: issues under consideration
2. Demographic tendencies of Lithuania
3. Employment and unemployment
4. Economic growth and competitiveness
5. Policy insights
6. Conclusions
1. The issues under consideration

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

- Lithuania is facing unprecedented **emigration**, leaking the young and the promising out from the labour market

- Local enterprises are facing an increasing constraint in the choice of specialists needed because of both – the **lack of qualified labour** and the **discrepancies in qualifications** needed and available

- The **average earnings** of the employed remain comparatively low in the context of the EU states, however, **labour productivity** is also comparatively low

- Economic competitiveness of Lithuania has dropped from the rank **35** in 2016 to **41** in 2017 according to the **Global Competitiveness Report** published by The World Economic Forum
2. Demographic tendencies of Lithuania

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

- During 22 years (1996 – 2018) Lithuania has lost 22.3% of its population, i.e. 805 thous. people
- The capital region lost 8.2%, whilst the rest of the country 26.8%
- Major share of emigrants – young citizens of 20-39 years old
- The share of young population from 15 to 29 years is decreasing since 2009
- Emigration target countries (as of 2016): UK (46.2%), Ireland (8.4%), Norway (7.8%), Germany (7.6%)
Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Population by counties as of Jan. 2018

Local Administrative Units - LAU former NUTS III

Data source: Statistics Lithuania
Natural population change in Lithuania

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Live births, deaths and natural population change, persons

Data source: Statistics Lithuania
Overall emigration and immigration

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Data source: Statistics Lithuania

Returning Lithuanian emigrants, persons
Emigrants, persons
Imigrants, persons

Aušrytė Rastenienė & Neringa Ramanauskė, Vilnius University, Lithuania
Loss of population by region

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Data source: Statistics Lithuania

Aušrėtė Rastenienė & Neringa Ramanauskė, Vilnius University, Lithuania
## Emigration impacts on economies of countries of origin

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Negative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short term</strong></td>
<td>▪ Unemployment is reduced</td>
<td>▪ A steep rise in wages in sectors that require labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Benefits from remittances (payments sent home by migrants)</td>
<td>▪ Loss of young workers and skilled professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Returning migrants bring savings, skills, business ideas and international contacts</td>
<td>▪ Reduction of current social insurance financing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Returning migrants bring savings, skills, business ideas and international contacts</td>
<td>▪ Immigrant adaptation costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long term</strong></td>
<td>▪ Returning migrants also contribute to technological progress</td>
<td>▪ Loss of human capital investments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ greater cultural links with more developed countries that enhance international trade</td>
<td>▪ Loss of highly trained people, especially health employees, engineers and very bright professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Deterioration of demographic situation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Decrease in aggregate demand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Share of young population in Lithuania

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Share of young population as percentage of the total population (based on Eurostat data)

From 15 to 29 years (scale on the right)
From 15 to 19 years (scale on the left)
Share of young population (comparison with the other small states)

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Share of young population as percentage of the total population (based on Eurostat data)

EU-28

Lithuania

Montenegro

Latvia

Estonia

Malta

Luxembourg

Slovenia

Macedonia

Cyprus

Albania


15,0 16,0 17,0 18,0 19,0 20,0 21,0 22,0 23,0 24,0 25,0
• According to Rosenzweig (2005), emigration from a country affects its aggregate income by affecting the skill price and the level of skill. There are a number of mechanisms.

• First, there is a general-equilibrium effect on the skill price: a reduction in the population because of out-migration makes labor more scarce and thus raises the skill price. The more skilled are the out-migrants the greater the amount of aggregate skill reduction and thus the larger the upward effect on the skill price. This effect is quantified in the world-wide general-equilibrium model of Hamilton and Whalley (1984), Walmsley et al. (2003) and Winters et al. (2003),

  – Nevertheless, they show both the enormous worldwide efficiency gains from moving persons from low to high skill price countries (as approximated by wages).

  – They also show that the general-equilibrium rise in skill prices (wages) in sending countries from increased international migration are significant.
The **second** effect of migration on average wages is the **compositional effect**: If out-migrants had the same average skill as the country as a whole average skill levels of remaining residents would be unchanged compared with the state prior to migration. However, If out-migrants are more skilled than average in the home country, then **average wages could decline**. However, all remaining residents still benefit from the rise in the skill price.

- The **average wage effect of out-migration can thus be a misleading indicator** of home-country welfare effects of migration due to compositional effects.

- Brain drain (or skilled migration) lowers the average skill level in sending countries and raises it in receiving countries (the compositional effect). Thus it lowers the skill price in the receiving country and raises it in the sending country, and therefore reduces the skill price gap. This will **decrease incentives for migration**.
LR effects of emigration on wages
Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

- **Effect on incentives to invest in skills.** The general-equilibrium rise in the skill price induced by the decrease in the quantity of skill in the economy increases the return to augmenting skills and thus will induce a rise in skill levels.
  - The higher the level of the skill of the out-migrants the greater the rise in the skill price, *more skilled out-migration will have a bigger effect* on skill upgrading than less skilled outmigration.

- **Effect on skill investments** (Beine et al., 2003). Residents of a country face an exogenous probability of being able to migrate to a higher skill price country. The skill price relevant to the skill investment decision is then not just the home country skill price, but the expected skill price in the potential destination country.
  - Increasing prospects for emigration thus has a direct *effect on incentives to invest in skills* in sending countries.
  - Moreover, investments in skills in sending countries would directly respond to changes in the skill prices of destination countries.
According to the Labour Force Survey data:

- In 2016 the activity rate of women aged 15 – 64 was 73.9, that of men – 77.1%. The employment rate of women aged 15 – 64 was 68.8, that of men – 70%. In IV quarter 2017, the unemployment rate in the country stood at 6.7%. During 2012 – 2017 unemployment of all types decreased.

- The average gross monthly earnings of women made up 84.4% of those of men. The gender pay gap in the private sector was bigger than in the public one and was 17.6% (in the public sector – 13.7%).

- According to Statistics Lithuania, in IV quarter 2017 average gross monthly earnings in the whole economy (individual enterprises excluded) totalled EUR 884.8: in the public sector – EUR 906.7, in the private sector – EUR 874. Average annual gross earnings of full-time employees of the private sector (according to Eurostat data) differ by 4-6.5 times in Lithuania and the emigration target countries.
Changes in Labour market regulation

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

• On 6 June 2017 the Lithuanian Parliament adopted amendments to the new Labour Code, and thus *changed labour market rules*, adding more flexibility in employer-employee relations as well as ensuring some important rights of the employees.

• From the perspective of labour market preconditions, potentially facilitating economic growth, the following amendments were important:
  
  – Employment termination, working time, overtime and annual leave conditions were liberalised, new types of employment contracts (i.e. project-based, job-sharing, apprenticeship employment contracts and employment contract for several employers) appeared, etc.
Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

- Labour market of Lithuania faces decrease in labor supply and growing demand for labour.
- Unemployment rate is decreasing, whilst job vacancy rate slightly increases.
- At the beginning of 2008, Labour demand grew the most in agriculture and construction.

Data source: Statistics Lithuania
Total unemployment rate comparison

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Unemployed persons as a percentage of the labour force (based on Eurostat data)

- Latvia
- Lithuania
- Estonia
- EU-28
- Slovenia
- Luxembourg
- Cyprus
- Malta

Job vacancy rate comparison

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Job vacancies in percent, measured as the proportion of total posts that are vacant (based on Eurostat data)
Labour supply characteristics

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

• In 2016, 94% of women and 89% of men aged 20–24 had at least upper secondary education. Recently, 50% of all students are women.

• In 2016, according to a survey on research and development (R&D), the number of inhabitants with a scientific degree engaging in R&D (in the general government and higher education sectors) totalled 7,7 thousand (51% of them women)

• According to the data of the survey on the use of information technologies in households, in 2016, computers were used by 73,5% of population (aged 16 – 74), the Internet – by 74,5%

• 86% of women and 80% of men aged 25–54 were using the Internet on a regular basis (at least once a week). In the youngest age group (aged 16–24), the proportions of women and men regularly using the Internet were similar (99 and 98% respectively).
Labour characteristics: education

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Women and men, aged 30 – 34, having completed tertiary education, in percent (based on Eurostat data)
Tertiary educational attainment as a percentage of population aged 30 to 34 (based on Eurostat data)
World talent rankings 2017

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

- World Competitiveness Center of the Institute for Management Development, Switzerland presents World talent rankings.

- The objective is to assess the extent to which countries develop, attract and retain talent to sustain the pool that enterprises employ to create long-term value.

- The methodology of the World Talent Ranking defines Talent Competitiveness into three main factors:
  - **Investment and development** (The investment in and development of home-grown talent)
  - **Appeal** (The ability of the country to tap into the overseas talent pool)
  - **Readiness** (The availability of skills and competencies in the talent pool)

- These are calculated using Statistics from international, regional and national sources as well as survey data (International Panel of Experts and Executive Opinion Survey).
### Data source: World Competitiveness Center, 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>World Talent Rating</th>
<th>Investment and Development Rating</th>
<th>Appeal Rating</th>
<th>Readiness Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>-10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Economic growth and competitiveness

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

GDP at current prices, euro per capita. Data source: Eurostat
GDP per capita and economic growth

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

GDP at current prices, euro per capita (columns, scale on the left) and change in GDP per capita, percent (line, scale on the right). Data source: Eurostat
Economic competitiveness index

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

• Competitiveness of a country’s economy is universally measured using the Global Competitiveness Index (GCI), developed by Sala-i-Martin and Artadi (2004) and released by The World Economic Forum

• A central objective of the GCR is to assess the capacity of the world’s economies to achieve sustained economic growth (and subsequently to provide high levels of prosperity for their citizens)

• GCI quantifies how productive a country is as it uses available resources. It comprises of over 110 variables, organised into twelve pillars, with each pillar representing an area considered as an important determinant of competitiveness (Schwab, 2010)

  – two thirds of the variables come from the Executive Opinion Survey (of a representative sample of business leaders in their respective countries), and one third comes from publicly available sources such as the United Nations
Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Global Competitiveness Index rankings 2009-2010 to 2017-2018

Data source: World Economic Forum
5. Policy insights

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

• The substantial out-migration of persons from low-income countries is in part a manifestation of problems in those countries. In the case of Lithuania, *increasing cost of living, income differences* and *ineffective labour market regulation* serve as economic preconditions, because of which migration is inevitable. Government should take preventive measures against emigration.

• Perhaps the most important mechanism, that can benefit Lithuania, is much *more attention for the return migration*, where migrants, who acquired new skills, accumulated assets, gained better knowledge of foreign markets, made business contacts and mastered new technologies, could kick-off economic spurt.

• Other measures could encompass *creating jobs*, improving *labour efficiency*, enhancing *internal mobility of labour*, providing *better infrastructure* to ensure the before mentioned means.
6. Conclusions

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

Lithuania faces extensive emigration, leaking young and promising specialists out of the country and causing extra costs to the economy in the short run. This has improved employment statistics and facilitates wage growth, on the other hand, businesses feel labour shortage as well as discrepancies between qualifications of the available labour supply and the demanded qualifications in the labour market.

skilled migration lowers the average skill level in Lithuania and is supposed to reduce the skill price gap in the long run and decrease incentives for migration. However, due to the very high wage differences, comparatively higher job vacancy rates in the hosting countries and the small absolute numbers of the emigrants, making little effect on the labour markets of the latter, it is not likely that the compositional effect will provide the desired impact in the nearest future
Conclusions (2)

Labour market trends and prospects for economic competitiveness of Lithuania

- The available theoretical data suggest that, on net, in the long term emigration can have a **positive effect on the sending country**. Thus, labour migration can be economically beneficial for both countries – of origin and host countries. However, with present comparatively low productivity rates and existing major wage differences, it is the rich and powerful countries that benefit most.
Thanks for your attention!